





BUILDING HEALTHY CITIES

Food Hygiene in Traditional Markets

Da Nang Journey Map Series 2020-2021

About This Series

Building Healthy Cities (BHC) is a USAID-funded learning project in four Smart Cites in Asia – Indore, India; Makassar, Indonesia; Da Nang, Vietnam; and Kathmandu, Nepal. BHC is testing how to successfully apply urban planning approaches that improve the social determinants of health in complex systems.

BHC uses exploratory data collection, multisectoral engagement, and citizen participation. This systems approach informs project activities and the prioritization of city-funded workplans. The combined impact should improve the lives of all residents in these three cities and reduce preventable mortality.

BHC is using several tools and processes to create coalitions and organize its approach in each city. One key process is systems mapping to illustrate the key dynamics (patterns underlying problems) and define key entry (or 'leverage') points to address social and environmental determinants of health. Another way that BHC is documenting citizen experiences in each city is through Journey Maps.

The Journey Maps apply 'design thinking' approaches, which are often used to tailor products to intended customers; citizens are like customers in that they pay taxes or fees to use city services. BHC has adapted this tool to document the experience (or 'journey') of citizens who are trying to overcome one service issue in each city, over time, updated on a quarterly basis. The specific topics were identified during the first year of activities in each city and fit within the larger context shown in the systems maps. BHC is using these Journey Maps to track citizen and city official perspectives, and to document change at the neighborhood level.

BHC is training people in each neighborhood to develop and use these Journey Maps and on grassroots advocacy techniques. By bringing the citizen experience directly to city planners, BHC hopes to better align municipal planning with community priorities such as safe water, clean air, hygiene, traffic safety, and other key components of healthy urban living.

Life of Project Journey Map Summary

BHC is concluding the Journey Maps in 2021. This process brought insights into day-to-day service availability for Da Nang residents, and created a regular dialogue with the community and city offices about the causes, consequences, and potential solutions to persistent urban health-related issues.

In this 2-year map, COVID-19 was initially a significant roadblock to improvements at the focus market. However, the temporary market closure allowed for finishing structural improvements. COVID-19 prevention measures, such as requiring hand washing, and regularly cleaning the floor and surfaces, made the market more sanitary and safer for food sale and consumption. BHC also developed a food safety app, TraceFood, focusing on traceability and food safety in restaurants, and promoted it to market customers. BHC hopes customers will use it to continue to improve safe food purchases.













BUILDING HEALTHY CITIES





Da Nang Journey Map #1 - Food Hygiene in Traditional Markets

YEAR 3 Da Nang City currently has 70 traditional markets. The city government directly manages 4 level-1 markets, while the smaller markets are under the management of district or commune people's committees (PC). These traditional markets provide about 70% of food demand for Da Nang citizens. Most of these markets were built around 15 years ago and are significantly degraded.

Nai Hien Dong Market is in a crowded residential area which attracts many people for trading. The market is in the Son Tra District which has many beautiful beaches, hotels, and restaurants, therefore this market is also an attractive tourist destination. The hygienic infrastructure of Nai Hien Dong Market is degraded which negatively affects the market's condition.







Wet floor at seafood selling area (left, source: BHC, Sept. 2020). Before (center) and after (right) a garbage collection point was addressed (source: Citizen's Feedback Portal, February 15 and February 28, 2020).

DATA POINT:

"Food hygiene and safety at the markets is inadequate due to both markets' infrastructure and traders' behaviors. Sanitation systems in the market are often unsafe due to overloads and pollutants that accumulate for a long time. The concentration of polluted substances such as H2S, NH3, suspended TSS, BOD, NH4+, nitrogen and phosphor are 2 to 5 times higher; especially the average coliform concentration is 90 times higher than what is allowed in the standard."

 Food System Analysis Through Food Value of Seafood, Vegetable and Meat,

"On a road beside the Nai Hien Dong Market, there are many trash bins that occupy 1/3 of the road which causes the loss of urban aesthetic....and stink!

Resident, February 2020

"The Commune PC has requested Son Tra Environmental Enterprise to clean the area and arrange the placement of trash bins to ensure the urban aesthetic and environment surrounding the Nai Hien Dong Market."

- Commune PC. February 2020

"In the context of the pandemic COVID-19, the market management board and Commune PC have deployed several activities such as cleaning the environment, spraying disinfectants, arranging hand sanitizer at the gate of market, requiring all sellers and customers wear masks and keep a safe distance, propaganda by loudspeaker, etc."

"In 2020, the Son Tra District Market Management Board

has some plans to upgrade the hygienic infrastructure in

the activity (constructing the roof) planned to be

conducted in Q1 has been postponed."

the NHD Market. However, due to the pandemic outbreak,

Food Safety Management Authority Official, April 2020

— Nai Hien Dong Commune PC, March 2020



NO ACTION:

While changes have been proposed to improve drainage, none have been agreed upon yet.

"Although the Market Management Team regularly cleans and uses high pressure pumps (firefighting) to clean and clear the drainage, but the problem that the citizen complained still exists. The reasons include (1) the market's topographic is lower than surrounding area, so it is often flooded in the rainy season; (2) long drainage pipes in the market make it difficult to drain; (3) people's habits (littering, used cooking oil and grease disposal into sewer). The Authority is proposing Department of Industry and Trade to support the project of improving drainage and storm water system at Nai Hien Dong Market, worth about 100 million VND."

Son Tra District Market Management Authority, June 2020



NO ACTION:

Due to a second wave of COVID-19 in Da Nang, drainage changes have been delayed.

"The floor of the seafood selling area was still wet, I think this area is very hard to dry out. But to be honest, compared to other ones in the neighborhood, this market is even cleaner."

— Customer in Nai Hien Dong Market, Sept. 2020

"For the Nai Hien Dong market, we have concentrated our efforts and energy in fighting against the COVID-19 pandemic. Our staff worked from early morning to the close of business at 7pm everyday to make sure regulations and restrictions were strictly followed. We also had the market disinfected and only 50% of food shop owners could do their business during this period. Overall, the Board has made great efforts to maintain the market's operation to the normal status as much as possible with fewer customers than usual by applying the 'staggered' entrance tickets. No serious cases relating to food safety, sanitation, and hygiene were reported "

Son Tra District Market Management Authority, Sept 2020









"Floor of seafood selling area is often wet. The condition is improved compared to 2-3 years ago, but the situation of not draining water still happens

- Customer in Nai Hien Dong Market, July 2020

"Drainage in ready food selling area needs to be dredged. Waste cooking oil accumulates a lot, causing blockage...causing risks on food safety."

Vendor in Nai Hien Dong Market, July 2020

"I did not go to the market very often recently due to the COVID-19, the local government restricted the number of market visits per person. However, during that time of lockdown, I

> Customer in Nai Hien Dong Market, Sept. 202

found the market cleaner

because there were fewer

vendors and customers."

"During the outbreak of COVID-19, the market management requested that the market be closed for 5 days to disinfect all. After that, the market was very deserted, the board asked us to wear masks, disinfect our hands and have our own hand sanitizers. The drainage of my kiosk works normally, I do not see any problems."

- Vendor in Nai Hien Dong Market,











No Action













Building Healthy Cities is a five-year cooperative agreement funded by the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) under Agreement No. AID-OAA-A-17-00028, beginning September 30, 2017. BHC is implemented by JSI Research & Training institute, Inc. (JSI) with partners International Organization for Migration, Thrive Networks Global, and Urban Institute, and with support from Engaging Inquiry, LLC. This report is made possible by the generous support of the American people through USAID. The contents are the responsibility of Building Healthy Cities and do not necessarily reflect the views of USAID or the United States government.



BUILDING HEALTHY CITIES





Da Nang Journey Map #1 - Food Hygiene in Traditional Markets

YEAR 4 Da Nang City currently has 70 traditional markets. The city government directly manages 4 level-1 markets, while the smaller markets are under the management of district or commune people's committees (PC). These traditional markets provide about 70% of food demand for Da Nana citizens. Most of these markets were built around 15 years ago and are significantly degraded.

Nai Hien Dong Market is in a crowded residential area which attracts many people for trading. The market is in the Son Tra District which has many beautiful beaches, hotels, and restaurants, therefore this market is also an attractive tourist destination. The hygienic infrastructure of Nai Hien Dona Market is dearaded which negatively affects the market's condition.





Few people inside the market due to COVID-19 restrictions (left) and the empty market during the COVID-19 closure in September 2021 (right).



NO ACTION:

No changes were made to improve the

"In general, everyone has a point of view and I respect all of citizens" comments. Regarding the food safety issues. Nai Hien Dong market has been concerned and propagated but it still has certain limitations. The awareness of citizens plays an important role in this problem. As far as I know, there was no new budget in last quarter for food safety activities in this market."

- Food Safety Management Authority Official, Dec. 2020

'I usually ao to this market every weekends. Compared with other markets in Da Nang city, I found the sanitary and food safety situation is quite good. The toilet is now cleaner than before. I recommend that the market management agency should post all the hygiene food stall on the daily notice board in the

- Market Customer, Dec.

In the rainy season, there is standing water in the market which affects the travel of customers and vendors. The water and trash are not cleaned timely. I hope that the market management board will have a plan to the market so that we could have a good working environment and the customers could travel more conveniently."

repair the roads and drains in

– Market Vendor, Dec. 202

"We comply with all the

management board and

participate in food safety

sometimes not as clean as

our expectation and I hope

invested more in facilities in

training. The market is

that the market will be

the future.

regulations of market



NO ACTION:

While overall impressions of the market's cleanliness were positive, there was still standing water on certain days.

"In 2021, Son Tra Market Management Board has chosen Nai Hien Dong Market...to implement Food Safety Market. It is one of the important criteria of Da Nana city. Overall, the board has made areat efforts to improve the hygiene and other related problems that the citizens reported. To implement the Food Safety Market here, we are calling for potential donors to donate for tools and equipment of detoxification and antiseptic." — Son Tra District Market Management Authority, March 2021

"In this market, my favorite is the sellers are always happy and do not ask for two prices, the goods are always complete. However, it is sometimes unsanitary in the rainy days since the standing water. I hope that the market will be reworked and there will be no standing water or bad smell in the future." — Market Customer, March 2021

DATA POINT:



Of the 280 small businesses in the market, 28 sell meat and 35 sell fish/seafood. About 70% of customers visit the food areas in the market. Compared to the previous quarter, the number of vendors increased by 3-4 for each type of food (e.g., meat, seafood, fruit, prepared food).





"The market has been upgraded a lot these times including: the stalls are divided...and the hygiene is significantly improved. However, there are standing water and bad smell in the rainy days so I hope that the management board will take measures to deal with these problems

and the market will be cleaner and

- Market Vendor, Dec. - Market Vendor, March 2021

more beautiful."

"The market has been

improved in sanitation and upgraded a lot. The waste is gathered at the end of the fish stalls. My favorite are the sellers here do not overcharge, means of transport are always watched carefully and the aisles are wide, comfortable."

- Market Vendor, March 2021

ACTION:



While positive changes are being made to the physical structures at the market, the vendors have been financially impacted by COVID-19's effect on the number of people visiting the market. 50% of stores have closed since the COVID-19 outbreak began. A voucher/coupon system was also put in place to limit the number of people in the market at a time, to reduce COVID-19 transmission.

"During the complicated pandemic, the market management board had a hard time controlling the market goers and we always follow the pandemic prevention measures such as measuring temperature and disinfecting people's hands before entering the market, check the people's vouchers to go to the market. The market goers can only buy and take food away and 100% of all people must wear a mask when entering the market. Some vendors often trade on the street to increase their revenue and serve some people who do not have a market coupon. This makes it is difficult to control the pandemic prevention."

Nai Hien Dona Market Management Board, June 2021



The market reopened and implemented "Food Safety Market" measures.

customers and received the following feedback:
" the TraceFood application is very beneficial for tracing

- food origins. I will search and download this application to
- them are unsafe for us. TraceFood application will be good for us to trace food origins and search for safe food supplie

"From Aug. 16, 2021 to Sept. 15, 2021, almost all markets in Son Tra district are closed according to government's regulation. From Sept. 21, the market re-opened with 30%-50% sellers, they must comply with [COVID-19 prevention] direction.... Nai Hien Dong market is implementing the "Food Safety Market" by taking measures: the market areas are cleaned regularly; the goods are inspected carefully and the prices are ensured to be stabilized."

— Nai Hien Dong Market Management Board, Sept. 2021





'We just back to the market from Sept. 21st...There are quite many people go out to buy food. All buyers and sellers must comply with pandemic prevention and control such as: wearing masks, keeping a safe distance from others, washing hands by sanitizers."

- Market Vendor, Sept. 2021

Journey Map Summary

In this 2-year map, COVID-19 was initially a significant roadblock to improvements at the market. However, the temporary market closure allowed for finishing structural improvements. COVID-19 prevention measures, such as requiring hand washing, and regularly cleaning the floor and surfaces, made the market more sanitary and safer for food sale and consumption. BHC also developed a food safety app, TraceFood, focusing on traceability and food safety in restaurants, and promoted it to market customers. BHC hopes customers will use it to continue to improve safe food purchases.

"Due to the pandemic, the number of customers is much less than before, so the goods and revenue are reduced, the goods are imported less than before. The floor and the roof of the market are being repaired" — Market Vendor, June 2021

"Each family will be given five market coupons to use over the course of 15 days, so I go to the market less than before. I often use home delivery service and use food delivered from hometown."

- Market Customer, June 2021

I am fear being infected [with COVID-19] so I only go to the market once a week. I often order the food for home delivery. There should be one sanitizer dispenser in front of each store, sellers need to comply with wearing masks and gloves to prevent the pandemic. Moreover, the market coupons should be provided enough for all market goers, especially for students and employees.

Market Customer, June 2021

spoiled food to process food. I hope that all sellers could be trained more on food

"It is raining and quite hard to go to the

market these days. The standing water...in

the market creates unhygienic condition.

The food safety issues should be paid more

attention. The market management agency

should have a regulation...for all sellers to

wear masks, hair cap, gloves and do not use

- Market Customer, Dec. 2020











Quarter 3

Building Healthy Cities is a five-year cooperative agreement funded by the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) under Agreement No. AID-OAA-A-17-00028, beginning September 30, 2017. BHC is implemented by JSI Research & Training Institute, Inc. (JSI) with partners International Organization for Migration, Thrive Networks Global, and Urban Institute, and with support from Engaging Inquiry, LLC. This report is made possible by the generous support of the American people through USAID. The contents are the responsibility of Building Healthy Cities and do not necessarily reflect the views of USAID or the United States government.







How Does This Story Connect to the Da Nang Systems Map?

Loop 4: Chasing Our Tails

policy initiatives underperform, perpetuate continued underperformance. underperforming policy initiative increases the risk to the public and thereby drives more reactionary action by city leaders. This not only strains funds, but strains human resourcing when personnel are pulled off important efforts with a longer view, to react to emerging challenges. As staff and programs are not properly resourced, people get disillusioned and burned out, leading to turnover (and often leading to the loss of the best and brightest). Turnover in personnel leads to a decrease in institutional knowledge when both experienced and expert people leave the organization, which can impact the quality of design and implementation of important city initiatives.

Example 1: Food safety is always a concern in Da Nang city. Farmers learned to transform their cultivation to receive Viet-gap certificates several years ago. Unfortunately, there were some "fake

certificates of Vietgap" thus farmers did not trust such policies. The number of staff remains limited so they were not able to rigorously check and monitor the whole supply chain. As a result, farmers do not feel pressure to pay the necessary attention to safe cultivation practices. There is also a lack of human resources to control the use of chemical compounds and pesticide in farming activities. This lack of oversight undermines citizen faith in government initiatives to provide access to safe foods.

Example 2: The management of beach front resorts involves 5 different departments/agencies (Department of Transportation, Department of Tourism, the District People's Committee, the Management Board of Son Tra Peninsula, DARD). The overlapping management can cause slow response and ineffective problem solving. For example, a big issue to tourism is litter. However, since there are many stakeholders involved it is difficult to speak up and hard to coordinate and manage action to make improvements.

